



## Minutes of the meeting of 17 May 2024

**of the Evaluation committee of the third phase of the Innovation Partnership entitled “Building green and climate neutral city hubs across European cities” – contract notice 2023/S 201-632428 - published under the framework of the CLIMABOROUGH project.**

---

On 17 May 2024 at 10:30 AM CEST in a public session, realised via Zoom at the following link: <https://us02web.zoom.us/j/87203824889> as announced on the CLIMABOROUGH project website at the URL: <https://climaborough.eu/public-procurement/tender/> the last public meeting was held of the Evaluation committee of the aforementioned Innovation Partnership, composed of the following members:

Name	Last Name	Partner of affiliation	Status
Anna	Athanasiou	City of Ioannina	Attending
Antonio	Vita	City of Turin	Attending
Céline	Pellorce	Grenoble Alpes Metropole	Not attending
Chiara	Bernardini	Hereon	Attending
Christina	Kalogirou	City of Ioannina	Attending
Deja	Jurjec	City of Maribor	Attending
Elissaios	Sarmas	DAEM	Not Attending
Goran	Rodic	PREDA	Not attending
Ilia	Christantoni	DAEM	Attending
Joao	Dinis	City of Cascais	Not attending
Ksenija	Napast	EZAVOD	Attending
Metodiyka	Tarlyovska	City of Sofia	Not attending
Luc	Arend	City of Differdange	Attending
Mariam	Gallee	Grenoble Alpes Metropole	Attending
Laura	Ribotta	City of Turin	Attending
Mateja	Bitenc	City of Maribor	Attending
Metodi	Avramov	City of Sofia	Not attending
Sébastien	Pineau	Luxembourg Institute of Science and Technology	Not attending
Simone	Gheri	ANCI Toscana Single Responsible Person (RUP in Italian language) for the public procurement procedure	Attending



supported by Ms Giulia del Turco, from ANCI Toscana, acting as Secretary and authoring these minutes. Other members of the ANCI Toscana / CLIMABOROUGH project team attending the meeting were: Mr Besnik Mehmeti, Mr Francesco Molinari and Mr Matteo Satta.

The following external observers were present at the meeting, who were identified via the Zoom platform:

- Mr Leonardo Picari from Planergy
- Ms Paulina Caldarelli from Erion
- Mr Pavlos Dionysopoulos from AETHON Engineering
- Ms Maria Karampela from Uni Systems
- Ms Carla Mereu from d-fine
- Ms Silvia Fiore from Politecnico of Turin
- Mr Davide Miceli from city of Turin
- Mr Christos Ioakeimidis from INTELIGG
- Ms Paola Ameglio from Mercato Circolare
- Mr Ruggero Goglio from Arcobaleno Cooperativa Sociale
- Mr Hristo Popov from Theoremus
- Mr Nikolaos Lettas, INNORA
- Ms Laura Drago from ANCI Toscana
- Mr Nikolaos Lettas from INNORA
- Mr Harris Moysiadis from FINT/Helfihub
- Ms Elena Ferrero from Atelier Riforma
- Mr Tasos Athanasopoulos from Intracom Telecom
- Ms Giulia Garzon from Energy Institute Linz
- Mr Alberto Laurenti
- Mr Demetris Gerogiannis from AnaldMe
- Mr Gavin Duffy from RealSim
- Mr Francesco Catena from BIP
- Mr Yannick Bousse from CINEA
- Mr Kostas Stefanou from LIME Technology
- Ms Eleni Magklara, CINEA
- Ms Emanuela Rosio from ERICA soc. Coop.
- Mr Luca Campadello from Erion Textiles
- Ms Elpida Neofytou from Intracom Telecom
- Ms Dimitra Tsakanika from DAEM
- Mr Christos Bellos from LIME Technology
- Mr Nahad Helmi from Bitagreen
- Mr Basilio Lo Re, Planergy



- Mr Dimitrios Stamatelopoulos from ELEMSI
- Ms Laura Fasoli from Arcobaleno
- Mr Fabrizio Perrotta from R2M
- Mr Nikolaos Katertsidis from UOWM
- Mr Eleftherios Kiamilis form Unisystems
- Mr Eric Barrès from Siradel
- Ms Martina Surynkova from PILSEN (SITMP)
- Mr Giacomo Giargia from Arcobaleno
- Espinel from SiradelxHexadone
- Ms Lisa Filippidou from DOTSOFT SA
- Mr Levent Gürgen from Kentyou
- Mr Hugo Kerschot from V-ICT-OR/IS Practice
- Ms Angelina Bintoudi from Optimems
- Mr Christos Timplalexis from Optimems
- Mr Leo Georgel from Hexadone

After a brief welcome speech, Mr Gheri informed the participants that the main purpose of the meeting – held in public session online – was to form the final ranking of the 31 received proposals on the ANCI Toscana GoodGrants™ platform by the deadline of April 15<sup>th</sup>, 2024 at 11:59 PM CEST. Each proposal was composed by a Technical Offer accompanied by a Financial Offer and a certain number of attachments. The list of received proposals had been confirmed in a previous Decree of the RUP - no. 104 of 24 April 2024 – which is available on the official website of the CLIMABOROUGH project in a dedicated section at the URL: <https://climaborough.eu/public-procurement/tender/>.

The evaluation process has been carried out in two steps: first, the members of the Evaluation Committee assessed the Technical Offers accompanied by all its attachments as made available on the GoodGrants™ platform by the respective applicants. The assessment was carried out using the criteria and scores listed in paragraph 6.4 “Final evaluation” of Annex 1 to the Contract notice (Tender Regulations), with the only exception of the “Discount off the Base Price” criterion. The results of the first step of assessment were approved internally in a specific meeting of the Evaluation Committee, which was held online on May 14<sup>th</sup>, 2024 at 11:00 AM CEST. The ranking of the 31 applications resulting from the first step of the evaluation process is reproduced here below:

<b>Application name</b>	<b>Lot name</b>	<b>Score attributed to the Technical Offer</b>
226 – Theoremus DTRS ...	Cascais	66
208 – ClimaGre	Grenoble	65
222 – SCANTEC GmbH	Maribor	64

<b>Application name</b>	<b>Lot name</b>	<b>Score attributed to the Technical Offer</b>
237 - RIVestiTO	Torino	64
232 – Traccia-TO	Torino	63
196 – Zelus PC	Cascais	62
209 – Lot4- Grenoble_SiradelxHexadone	Grenoble	61
195 – Theoremus Park with Me	Sofia	60
189 - Enerwise	Athens	58
185 – LUNES cLima sUstainable eNErgy ...	Athens	58
184 – Dimitrios Stamateloupolos LP Elemsi	Athens	58
202 – DECAFF DECArbonising ...	Differdange	57
199 – NATALI multilingua lDATA ...	Differdange	57
227 – Blimp	Sofia	55
186 – INTRACOM TELECOM – AETHON	Athens	54
225 – SIGNORA Smart parking ...	Sofia	54
260 – Modeshift Europe	Sofia	54
191 - c-BEMS ATH	Athens	53
201 – IES Lot 3	Differdange	52
234 – Arcobaleno Cooperativa Sociale	Torino	51
217 – Lime Technology	Ioannina	50
218 – DFGLake	Ioannina	49
216 – LakeGuard	Ioannina	47
233 – d-fine_polito	Torino	47
187 - Athens Next-Gen Energy Alliance ...	Athens	46
203 – Lot3-Differdange- SiradelxHexadone	Differdange	44
206 – Bita Green Solv	Grenoble	44
213 – SELENA Sustainable Lake ...	Ioannina	43



<b>Application name</b>	<b>Lot name</b>	<b>Score attributed to the Technical Offer</b>
188 – Planergy	Athens	43
221 – Business Integration Partners spa	Torino	43
190 - IES Lot 1	Athens	41

The second step of the proposal evaluation will be finalised during the meeting of today. In the past days, the RUP of the procedure for ANCI Toscana, supported by his staff members as introduced above, has ranked the received Financial Offers according to the criterion omitted from the first step of the evaluation. The members of the Evaluation Committee have not been informed of the results of this second step of the evaluation. The ranking was made according to the provisions of paragraph 6.4 “Final evaluation” of the Tender Regulations, as far as the “Discount off the Base Price” criterion was concerned. In particular, 1 (one) point was attributed for each full percentage point of discount (without considering the fractions), with a maximum score of 30 points per proposal. The list of operated discounts in the received Financial Offers with the resulting attribution of scores is reproduced here below:

<b>Application name</b>	<b>Lot name</b>	<b>Discount operated</b>	<b>Score attributed to the Financial Offer</b>
201 – IES Lot 3	Differdange	36.00%	30
232 – Traccia-TO	Torino	30.09%	30
189 - Enerwise	Athens	30.00%	30
186 – INTRACOM TELECOM – AETHON	Athens	30.00%	30
218 – DFGlake	Ioannina	30.00%	30
216 – LakeGuard	Ioannina	30.00%	30
217 – Lime Technology	Ioannina	30.00%	30
195 – Theoremus Park with Me	Sofia	30.00%	30
185 – LUNES cLima sUustainable eNErgy ...	Athens	21.00%	21
203 – Lot3-Differdange-SiradelxHexadone	Differdange	18.90%	18
188 – Planergy	Athens	18.67%	18
209 – Lot4-Grenoble_SiradelxHexadone	Grenoble	18.51%	18
234 – Arcobaleno Cooperativa Sociale	Torino	16.02%	16

Application name	Lot name	Discount operated	Score attributed to the Financial Offer
202 – DECAFF DECArbonising ...	Differdange	15.00%	15
208 – ClimaGre	Grenoble	15.00%	15
187 - Athens Next-Gen Energy Alliance ...	Athens	15.00%	15
190 - IES_Lot 1	Athens	13.33%	13
206 – Bita Green Solv	Grenoble	12.64%	12
225 – SIGNORA Smart parking ...	Sofia	12.00%	12
237 - RIVestiTO	Torino	11.27%	11
199 – NATALI multilinguaL dATA ...	Differdange	11.00%	11
213 – SELENA Sustainable Lake ...	Ioannina	10.00%	10
196 – Zelus PC	Cascais	7.00%	7
227 – Blimp	Sofia	7.00%	7
184 – Dimitrios Stamateloupolos LP Elemsi	Athens	6.00%	6
260 – Modeshift Europe	Sofia	5.00%	5
233 – d-fine_polito	Torino	1.08%	1
221 – Business Integration Partners spa	Torino	0.67%	0
191 - c-BEMS ATH	Athens	0.00%	0
226 – Theoremus DTRS ...	Cascais	0.00%	0
222 – SCANTEC GmbH	Maribor	0.00%	0

Now according to the rules of the procedure, as stated in the Tender regulations, the two scores (of the Technical and Financial Offers) must be summed up, as prescribed by paragraph 2.7 “Number of lots and maximum number of awarded tenders” of the Tender Regulations, in order to reach the final ranking and provisionally award 2 (two) applications per lot. The award will only be provisional due to the necessity of performing a set of legal and administrative checks and audits of the declarations provided by each economic operator (single or associate) during the various phases of the competition, before the Innovation Partnership Agreement with ANCI Toscana can be signed. Moreover, a standstill period of 20 days has been foreseen by paragraph 7.2 of the Tender regulations, to provide time for the unsuccessful applicants to challenge the award decision before any contract is entered into.

In conclusion, after summing up the score of the Technical Offer with that of the Financial Offer, the following, final ranking of received applications is generated:

Application name	Lot name	Score attributed to the Technical Offer	Score attributed to the Financial Offer	Total score
232 – Traccia-TO	Torino	63	30	93
195 – Theoremus Park with Me	Sofia	60	30	90
189 - Enerwise	Athens	58	30	88
186 – INTRACOM TELECOM – AETHON	Athens	54	30	84
201 – IES_Lot 3	Differdange	52	30	82
208 – ClimaGre	Grenoble	65	15	80
217 – Lime Technology	Ioannina	50	30	80
209 – Lot4- Grenoble_SiradelxHexadone	Grenoble	61	18	79
185 – LUNES cLima sUustainable eNErgy ...	Athens	58	21	79
218 – DFGlake	Ioannina	49	30	79
216 – LakeGuard	Ioannina	47	30	77
237 - RIVestiTO	Torino	64	11	75
202 – DECAFF DECArbonising ...	Differdange	57	15	72
196 – Zelus PC	Cascais	62	7	69
199 – NATALI multilinguaL dATA ...	Differdange	57	11	68
234 – Arcobaleno Cooperativa Sociale	Torino	51	16	67
226 – Theoremus DTRS ...	Cascais	66	0	66
225 – SIGNORA Smart parking ...	Sofia	54	12	66
222 – SCANTEC GmbH	Maribor	64	0	64
184 – Dimitrios Stamateloupolos LP Elemsi	Athens	58	6	64

Application name	Lot name	Score attributed to the Technical Offer	Score attributed to the Financial Offer	Total score
203 – Lot3-Differdange-SiradelxHexadone	Differdange	44	18	62
227 – Blimp	Sofia	55	7	62
188 – Planergy	Athens	43	18	61
187 - Athens Next-Gen Energy Alliance ...	Athens	46	15	61
260 – Modeshift Europe	Sofia	54	5	59
206 – Bita Green Solv	Grenoble	44	12	56
190 - IES_Lot 1	Athens	41	13	54
191 - c-BEMS ATH	Athens	53	0	53
213 – SELENA Sustainable Lake ...	Ioannina	43	10	53
233 – d-fine_polito	Torino	47	1	48
221 – Business Integration Partners spa	Torino	43	0	43

Considering only the two best ranked applications (if available) per lot, the following ones are provisionally awarded:

Application name	Lot name	Score attributed to the Technical Offer	Score attributed to the Financial Offer	Total score
232 – Traccia-TO	Torino	63	30	93
195 – Theoremus Park with Me	Sofia	60	30	90
189 - Enerwise	Athens	58	30	88
186 – INTRACOM TELECOM – AETHON	Athens	54	30	84
201 – IES_Lot 3	Differdange	52	30	82
208 – ClimaGre	Grenoble	65	15	80
217 – Lime Technology	Ioannina	50	30	80
209 – Lot4-Grenoble_SiradelxHexadone	Grenoble	61	18	79
218 – DFGLake	Ioannina	49	30	79



Application name	Lot name	Score attributed to the Technical Offer	Score attributed to the Financial Offer	Total score
237 - RIVestiTO	Torino	64	11	75
202 – DECAFF DECArbonising ...	Differdange	57	15	72
196 – Zelus PC	Cascais	62	7	69
226 – Theoremus DTRS ...	Cascais	66	0	66
225 – SIGNORA Smart parking ...	Sofia	54	12	66
222 – SCANTEC GmbH	Maribor	64	0	64

The respective economic operators (single or associate) will be promptly notified in writing of the evaluation outcome and of the imminent start of the legal and administrative checking and auditing procedure. To avoid any delay in the finalisation of all the Innovation Partnership Agreement signatures, the same checks and audits will also be started for economic operators having presented the proposal ranking third in each lot (if available).

The following questions were asked:

- 1) Mr Yannick Bousse asked if proposals with a score of 0 in the Financial Offer means that they did not submit Financial Offer. Mr. Francesco Molinari clarified that those who received a score of 0 in the "Financial Offer" section means that they submitted a discount of 0% or less than 1%.
- 2) Mr Harris Moysiadis asked whether in cities where the requirement of 2 solutions per lot is not covered, it is possible to award the third-place winner of other lot. Mr Francesco Molinari clarified that this is not possible because each lot has extremely different topic and set of requirements.
- 3) Mr Giacomo Giargia and Prof Silvia Fiore asked for clarification about the outcome of having two proposals addressing textile waste in Turin Lot. Mr. Molinari replied by referring to Annex 2 "Specific Requirements," where on p. 31 it says that: " The City welcomes proposals that deal with WEEE and textile waste either jointly or separately, and with one of the two types of waste as a minimum. It also considers acceptable a proposal that includes only one, or two, of the above improvement areas as a target".
- 4) Prof Ioakeimidis asked about the possibility to update the financial offer. Mr. Molinari clarified that this is not possible because there was a deadline for submission of the financial offer.



- 5) Prof. Ioakeimidis asked about the possibility of viewing other applicants' proposals. Mr Molinari clarified that it is certainly possible to access the documents, however within the limits of the principle of transparency.

These minutes have been prepared by the Secretary and read aloud during the recorded session. The minutes will be immediately published on the CLIMABOROUGH project website at the URL: <https://climaborough.eu/public-procurement/tender/> and shared with all the applicants by email.

Florence, 17 May 2024

The Evaluation Committee members:

Name	Last Name	Role	Signature
Anna	Athanasidou	Component	
Antonio	Vita	Component	
Céline	Pellorce	Component	
Chiara	Bernardini	Component	
Christina	Kalogirou	Component	
Deja	Jurjec	Component	
Elissaios	Sarmas	Component	
Goran	Rodic	Component	
Ilia	Christantoni	Component	
Joao	Dinis	Component	
Ksenija	Napast	Component	
Metodiyka	Tarlyovska	Component	
Luc	Arend	Component	
Mariam	Gallee	Component	
Laura	Ribotta	Component	
Mateja	Bitenc	Component	
Metodi	Avramov	Component	
Sébastien	Pineau	Component	
Simone	Gheri	Chairperson	

The Secretary: Ms Giulia del Turco