



Minutes of the meeting of 28 November 2025

of the Evaluation committee of the third phase of the Innovation Partnership entitled “Building green and climate neutral city hubs across European cities” – contract notice 300530-2025 changing the previous version 193321-2025 – published under the framework of the CLIMABOROUGH project on the OJ S 90/2025 of 12/05/2025 and earlier on the OJ S 60/2025 of 26/03/2025.

On 28 November 2025 at 11:30 AM CET in a public session, realised via Zoom at the following link: <https://us02web.zoom.us/j/85171233216> as announced on the CLIMABOROUGH project website at the URL: <https://climaborough.eu/public-procurement/follower-cities-climaborough-tender/>, the last public meeting was held of the Evaluation committee of the aforementioned Innovation Partnership, composed of the following members:

Name	Last Name	Partner of affiliation / Role	Status
Valerio	Barberis	Member of the CLIMABOROUGH Advisory Board	Not attending
Tomas	Benedikt	City of Pilsen	Attending
Mateja	Bitenc	Municipality of Maribor	Not attending
Julie	Chenini	City of Issy-les-Moulineaux	Not attending
Laurent	Deslattes	Grenoble-Alpes Métropole	Attending
Tanja	Ecim	City of Prijedor	Attending
Emil	Georgiev	City of Sofia	Attending
Simone	Gheri	ANCI Toscana – RUP (Single Responsible Person) of the procedure	Represented by Ms Elena Conti, ANCI Toscana
Mor	Harir	Member of the CLIMABOROUGH Advisory Board	Attending
Milica	Koncar	City of Prijedor	Not attending
Eric	Legale	City of Issy-les-Moulineaux	Attending
Tomas	Matraia	Member of the CLIMABOROUGH Advisory Board	Not attending
Besnik	Mehmeti	ANCI Toscana	Attending
Ksenija	Nepast	E-Zavod	Not attending
Katya	Valkova	City of Sofia	Not attending

supported by Ms Giulia del Turco, from ANCI Toscana, acting as Secretary and authoring these minutes. Other members of the ANCI Toscana / CLIMABOROUGH project team attending the meeting were: Mr Francesco Molinari and Mr Matteo Satta.



The following external observers were present at the meeting, who were identified via the Zoom platform:

- Mr Stephane Pages from AfB
- Mr Armin Alijagic
- Ms Flora Graioni from Emmaüs Connect
- Ms Eva Coscia from R2M Solution
- Ms Maria Bengtsson from UP
- Ms Gergana Grudeva UP
- Mr Giouli Chalitsiou from DOTSOFT
- Mr Thomas Boucaud from Emmaüs Connect
- Mr Duccio Schiavon from QUANTITAS
- Mr Predrag Pajić from MAXCODE
- Mr Drago Savic from MAXCODE
- Ms Elizabeth Filippidis from DOTSOFT
- Ms Emanuela Rosio from ERICA soc. Coop.
- Mr Devid Mazzaferro from QUANTITAS
- Mr Daniel Beran from RoadTwin
- Mr Jose Miguel Garcia from California Innovation Group
- Ms Sofia Magopoulou from DRAXIS
- Ms Martina di Gallo from R2M Solution
- Mr Anastasios Karakostas from DRAXIS
- Ms Nantia Salman from DOTSOFT
- Mr Andrea Buri from CityZ
- Mr Rodolfo Pinto from Superurbanity
- Ms Despoina Stoikou from DOTSOFT
- Mr Gianni Porelli from ERICA soc. Coop.
- Mr Ondřej Mareš from OneBerg
- Mr Nick Pantelidis from CERTH
- Ms Natasa Mountzidou from CERTH
- Ms Olga Vu from RoadTwin
- Ms Sara Alijagic from Nasa Perspektiva
- Mr Mihajlo Maksimović from MAXCODE DOO
- Ms Elise Goy from Emmaus Connect
- Mr Dragan Komljenović from Udruzenje Ekoraz
- Mr Bartosz Kowalczyk from CONNECTPOINT
- Mr Luca Fayoux-Cinelli from Issy Média
- Mr Marek Klekner from Oneberg



- Mr Jakub Tomiczek
- Mr Andrea Zedda from KODE
- Ms Zoi Bega from DOTSOFT

Mr Francesco Molinari informed the participants that the main purpose of the meeting – held in a public session online – was to form the final ranking of the 21 received proposals on the ANCI Toscana GoodGrants™ platform by the deadline of October 31st, 2025 at 11:59 PM CET. Each proposal was composed by a Technical Offer accompanied by a Financial Offer and a certain number of attachments. The list of received proposals had been confirmed in a previous Decree of the RUP – no. 259/25/I of 11 November 2025 – which is available on the official website of the CLIMABOROUGH project in a dedicated section at the URL: <https://climaborough.eu/public-procurement/follower-cities-climaborough-tender/>.

The evaluation process has been carried out in two steps: first, the members of the Evaluation Committee assessed the Technical Offers accompanied by all its attachments as made available on the GoodGrants™ platform by the respective applicants. The assessment was carried out using the criteria and scores listed in paragraph 6.4 “Final evaluation” of Annex 1 to the Contract notice (Tender Regulations), with the only exception of the “Discount off the Base Price” criterion. The ranking of the 21 applications resulting from the first step of the evaluation process is reproduced here below:

Application No.	Application name	Lot name	Score attributed to the Technical Offer
528	Neutrality Story Maps (NSM): A Digital Tool for Citizen Engagement in Sustainable Waste Management"	5 - Sofia	70
495	Grenera	5 - Sofia	68
489	SortSmartPrijedor	4 - Prijedor	66
505	Synergie I.T: a consortium to promote the reuse of IT equipment and its distribution across the Grenoble area especially to the most vulnerable populations	1 - Grenoble	65
507	aiDIANA: AI-Driven wAste maNAgeMent	5 - Sofia	65
498	cleverEATER : clever E- wAsTE Recovery	4 - Prijedor	59

513	Clim'Act Issy	2 - Issy-Les-Mouline aux	59
493	Data-driven and Community-led School Streets	3 - Pilsen	58
504	MARCO: sMart pAths for gReener sChoOls	3 - Pilsen	58
506	GrenAPP - WikiWaste Grenoble Experimentation	1 - Grenoble	58
490	PSRI: Prijedor Smart Recycling Initiative 2025	4 - Prijedor	57
487	SkolkaWay	3 - Pilsen	57
482	Community-Driven Mobility Planning	3 - Pilsen	57
494	BeSaFe-PilsenSmart & Safe School Commutes for a Sustainable City	3 - Pilsen	57
501	Issy Impact - Co-creating a Low-Carbon City through Civic Engagement	2 - Issy-Les-Mouline aux	55
491	KNO-W Kladimo se Na Otpad – the game make the difference in Prijedor Waste management	4 - Prijedor	53
503	CityZ Smart Mobility for Schools: digital and community-driven solutions to reduce traffic, emissions, and improve safety around Pilsen's schools	3 - Pilsen	53
492	smartLINA: SMART Local Intelligence for Neutrality Acceleration	2 - Issy-Les-Mouline aux	51
488	smart-ALICE: smart digitAl pLatform cIrCular It managEment	1 - Grenoble	48
500	Scaling Up the Zero Carbon Challenge: From Living Lab to Digital Platform	2 - Issy-Les-Mouline aux	41
497	CityZ Smart Mobility: integrated intelligent parking, carpooling, and sustainable commuting powered by sensors,	2 - Issy-Les-Mouline aux	39

	digital platforms, and AI	
--	---------------------------	--

The second step of the proposal evaluation will be finalised during the meeting of today. In the past days, the RUP of the procedure for ANCI Toscana, supported by his staff members as introduced above, has ranked the received Financial Offers according to the criterion omitted from the first step of the evaluation. The members of the Evaluation Committee have not been informed of the results of this second step of the evaluation. The ranking was made according to the provisions of paragraph 6.4 “Final evaluation” of the Tender Regulations, as far as the “Discount off the Base Price” criterion was concerned. In particular, 1 (one) point was attributed for each full percentage point of discount (without considering the fractions), with a maximum score of 30 points per proposal. The list of featured discounts in the received Financial Offers, with the resulting attribution of scores, is reproduced here below:

Application No.	Application name	Lot name	Discount operated	Score attributed to the Financial Offer
493	Data-driven and Community-led School Streets	3 - Pilsen	30.00%	30
507	aiDIANA: AI-Driven wAste maNAgeMent	5 - Sofia	30.00%	30
498	cleverEATER : clever E- wAsTE Recovery	4 - Prijedor	30.00%	30
488	smart-ALICE: smart digitAI pLatform cIrCular It managEment	1 - Grenoble	30.00%	30
492	smartLINA: SMART Local Intelligence for Neutrality Acceleration	2 - Issy-Les-Moulineaux	30.00%	30
504	MARCO: sMart pAths for gReener sChoOls	3 - Pilsen	30.00%	30
513	Clim'Act Issy	2 - Issy-Les-Moulineaux	30.00%	30
490	PSRI: Prijedor Smart Recycling Initiative 2025	4 - Prijedor	25.00%	25
506	GrenAPP - WikiWaste Grenoble Experimentation	1 - Grenoble	17.76%	17
501	Issy Impact - Co-creating a Low-Carbon City through Civic Engagement	2 - Issy-Les-Moulineaux	15.00%	15

500	Scaling Up the Zero Carbon Challenge: From Living Lab to Digital Platform	2 - Issy-Les-Moulineaux	10.00%	10
482	Community-Driven Mobility Planning	3 - Pilsen	7.00%	7
491	KNO-W Kladimo se Na Otpad – the game make the difference in Prijedor Waste management	4 - Prijedor	6.31%	6
494	BeSaFe-PilsenSmart & Safe School Commutes for a Sustainable City	3 - Pilsen	5.00%	5
487	SkolkaWay	3 - Pilsen	3.00%	3
495	Greenera	5 - Sofia	3.00%	3
489	SortSmartPrijedor	4 - Prijedor	2.50%	2
505	Synergie I.T: a consortium to promote the reuse of IT equipment and its distribution across the Grenoble area especially to the most vulnerable populations	1 - Grenoble	2.17%	2
528	Neutrality Story Maps (NSM): A Digital Tool for Citizen Engagement in Sustainable Waste Management"	5 - Sofia	1.00%	1
503	CityZ Smart Mobility for Schools: digital and community-driven solutions to reduce traffic, emissions, and improve safety around Pilsen's schools	3 - Pilsen	0.00%	0
497	CityZ Smart Mobility: integrated intelligent parking, carpooling, and sustainable commuting powered by sensors, digital platforms, and AI	2 - Issy-Les-Moulineaux	0.00%	0

Now according to the rules of the procedure, as stated in the Tender regulations, the two scores (of the Technical and Financial Offers) must be summed up, as prescribed by paragraph 2.7 "Number of lots and maximum number of awarded tenders" of the Tender Regulations, in order to reach the final ranking and provisionally award 2 (two) applications per lot. The award will only



be provisional due to the necessity of performing a set of legal and administrative checks and audits of the declarations provided by each economic operator (single or associate) during the various phases of the competition, before the Innovation Partnership Agreement with ANCI Toscana can be signed. Moreover, a standstill period of 20 calendar days has been foreseen by paragraph 7.2 of the Tender regulations, to provide time for the unsuccessful applicants to challenge the award decision before any contract is entered into.

In conclusion, after summing up the score of the Technical Offer with that of the Financial Offer, the following, final ranking of received applications is generated:

Application No.	Application name	Lot name	Score attributed to the Technical Offer	Score attributed to the Financial Offer	Total score
507	aiDIANA: AI-Driven wAste maNAgeMent	5 - Sofia	65	30	95
498	cleverEATER : clever E-wAsTE Recovery	4 - Prijedor	59	30	89
513	Clim'Act Issy	2 - Issy-Les-Moulineaux	59	30	89
493	Data-driven and Community-led School Streets	3 - Pilsen	58	30	88
504	MARCO: sMart pAths for gReener sChoOls	3 - Pilsen	58	30	88
490	PSRI : Prijedor Smart Recycling Initiative 2025	4 - Prijedor	57	25	82
492	smartLINA: SMART Local Intelligence for Neutrality Acceleration	2 - Issy-Les-Moulineaux	51	30	81
488	smart-ALICE: smart digitAI pLatform cIrCular It managEment	1 - Grenoble	48	30	78
528	Neutrality Story Maps (NSM): A Digital Tool for Citizen Engagement in	5 - Sofia	70	1	71

Sustainable Waste Management"					
495	Grenera	5 - Sofia	68	3	71
506	GrenAPP - WikiWaste Grenoble Experimentation	1 - Grenoble	58	17	71
501	Issy Impact - Co-creating a Low-Carbon City through Civic Engagement	2 - Issy-Les-Moulineaux	55	15	70
489	SortSmartPrijedor	4 - Prijedor	66	2	68
505	Synergie I.T: a consortium to promote the reuse of IT equipment and its distribution across the Grenoble area especially to the most vulnerable populations	1 - Grenoble	65	2	67
482	Community-Driven Mobility Planning	3 - Pilsen	57	7	64
494	BeSafe-PilsenSmart & Safe School Commutes for a Sustainable City	3 - Pilsen	57	5	62
487	SkolkaWay	3 - Pilsen	57	3	60
491	KNO-W Kladimo se Na Otpad – the game make the difference in Prijedor Waste management	4 - Prijedor	53	6	59
503	CityZ Smart Mobility for Schools: digital and community-driven solutions to reduce traffic, emissions, and improve safety around Pilsen's schools	3 - Pilsen	53	0	53
500	Scaling Up the Zero Carbon Challenge: From Living Lab to Digital Platform	2 - Issy-Les-Moulineaux	41	10	51

497	CityZ Smart Mobility: integrated intelligent parking, carpooling, and sustainable commuting powered by sensors, digital platforms, and AI	2 - Issy-Les-Moulineaux	39	0	39
-----	---	-------------------------	----	---	----

Considering only the two best ranked applications (if available) per lot, the following ones are provisionally awarded:

Application name	Lot name	Score attributed to the Technical Offer	Score attributed to the Financial Offer	Total score
507 - aiDIANA: AI-Driven waste management	5 - Sofia	65	30	95
498 - cleverEATER : clever E-waste Recovery	4 - Prijedor	59	30	89
513 - Clim'Act Issy	2 - Issy-les-Moulineaux	59	30	89
493 - Data-driven and Community-led School Streets	3 - Pilsen	58	30	88
504 - MARCO: smart paths for greener schools	3 - Pilsen	58	30	88
490 - PSRI : Prijedor Smart Recycling Initiative 2025	4 - Prijedor	57	25	82
492 - smartLINA: SMART Local Intelligence for Neutrality Acceleration	2 - Issy-les-Moulineaux	51	30	81
488 - smart-ALICE: smart digital platform circular management	1 - Grenoble	48	30	78
528 - Neutrality Story Maps (NSM): A Digital Tool for Citizen Engagement in Sustainable Waste Management"	5 - Sofia	70	1	71
506 - GrenAPP - WikiWaste Grenoble Experimentation	1 - Grenoble	58	17	71



The respective economic operators (single or associate) will be promptly notified in writing of the evaluation outcome and of the imminent start of the legal and administrative checking and auditing procedure.

The following questions were asked:

- 1) Ms Maria Bengtsson (UP) raised a question regarding the final ranking for Sofia, noting that there were two projects with the same score of 71 points (app. no. 528 and app. no. 495), but only one of them (app. no. 528) was selected in the final list. Mr Francesco Molinari acknowledged the error, checked the Tender Regulation and noted that no specific rule is foreseen at this stage of the procedure in case of a tie. He therefore clarified that the CLIMABOROUGH team will meet after this meeting to resolve the issue and will inform the participants as soon as possible.
- 2) Ms Flora Graioni (Emmaüs Connect) then asked for clarification on the procedure to follow in case an applicant wishes to challenge the decision. Mr Francesco Molinari explained that applicants are fully entitled to request further information on the evaluation of their proposal by simply sending an email to the organisers. They will receive the detailed evaluation of their project, including the breakdown of the scores awarded.

No other question was raised during the debate.

A draft version of these minutes was prepared by the Secretary and read aloud during the recorded session. This final version will be published on the CLIMABOROUGH project website at the URL: <https://climaborough.eu/public-procurement/follower-cities-climaborough-tender/> and shared with all the applicants by email.

Florence, 28 November 2025

The Evaluation Committee members:

Name	Last Name	Role	Signature
Valerio	Barberis	Component	
Tomas	Benedikt	Component	
Mateja	Bitenc	Component	
Julie	Chenini	Component	
Laurent	Deslattes	Component	
Tanja	Ecim	Component	
Emil	Georgiev	Component	



Mor	Harir	Component	
Milica	Koncar	Component	
Eric	Legale	Component	
Tomas	Matraia	Component	
Besnik	Mehmeti	Component	
Ksenija	Nepast	Component	
Katya	Valkova	Component	
Simone	Gheri	Chairperson	

The Secretary: Ms Giulia del Turco